Student and Community Workforce Agreement Task Force Optional Meeting Minutes

Nov. 6, 2019, 10 a.m.-12 p.m., ANEW, 7543 63rd Ave. NE Building 5B, Seattle, WA

Opening: The meeting began at 10:14 a.m. with Nancy Locke reminded the task force of their charge to keep racial equity in the forefront of this process and let them know that cards were provided based on lessons from our first meeting. Nancy then provided an overview of the meeting agenda and said there would be two presentations.

Task force members introduced themselves. Introductions started with Director Zachary DeWolf. He shared why this initiative is important to him and said many others in the city are already doing this work. DeWolf would like to make sure we are including students in this work. He said he is grateful to be part of this process.

Attending: Anna Pavlik, Karen Dove, Keith Weir, Anita Adams, David Hackney, Monty Anderson, Susan Dale (not on task force, but Seattle Public School parent, grad and consultant), Director Zachary DeWolf, Jane Mounsey, Stephanie Colbert, Mary Cauffman, Nancy Locke, Director Rick Burke and Harvey Wright were in attendance.

Locke explained why the task force were meeting at the ANEW location and said it’s a reminder that this is where students are learning. Students graduated Friday, so there are no students today.

Burke thanked everyone for their time and said we are investing in kids and city. This task force is a genesis of people asking how we are providing for our students. Burke provided his background. He is mechanical engineer, and his daughter is civil engineer. He is passionate about CTE work and said Seattle Public Schools is lagging behind. Burke wants kids to be excited about the opportunities available. He wants to put the S (students) on the community workforce agreements.

Locke said today’s presentation is oriented for those not familiar with Project Labor Agreement (PLA).

Colbert asked if there will be other opportunities for board members to attend task force meetings, so there could be dialogue with them. Locke said we have a block of time after Wright’s presentation.

Task force asked if they could access Microsoft (MS) Teams, where documents are stored. Weir doesn’t have access. Neither do the board members. Anderson asked Cauffman to resend the link.

Locke said a Forbes article is available on MS Teams for tasks force to read. So is today’s presentation.

Locke said PLA can be simple or wordy. In a PLA, a construction firm agrees they will use union workers. Most senior folks get priority for jobs. Locke asked if that was a fair representation of it. Anderson said yes. DeWolf asked if this process favors people of not of color. Weir and Anderson said not by race and seniority. Out of work list is used first for call-out. Dove said people of color can be prioritized in Community Workforce Agreement (CWA). Colbert said inequity inherit due to racial inequity issues and can be addressed by access. Workforce climate also plays a part in retention.

Locke said in PLA, the union agrees to dispute resolution, which helps prevent strikes and job delays.
PLAs are negotiated in different ways: contractor and owner. Task force is focusing on owner PLAs. Several Seattle departments have done them. There are a lot of local examples but not in Washington state schools. California schools have PLAs, but they don’t have students at the center of their PLAs.

PLA is a general term, but it has been flipped to CWA. Not everyone agrees to interchanging these terms. We are using a Student CWA or SCWA.

Provision outlined in CWA process. Examples are subcontracting opportunities, geographical priorities, etc.

Direct and preferred entry was explained from the view of Weir’s union. Preferred entry refers to veterans or graduates of an apprentice program. Anderson said some are harder to get into. Mechanical apprentice is one example. Trades are difficult to get into because they are good paying jobs. Laborers are a little easier. Carpenters and painters are examples of those a little easier to get into. It is important for contractors to be training agents/providers, Anderson said. Everyone should have a chance to get into the program they want to. Locke gave an example of Arbor Heights work to illustrate this issue.

DeWolf said Capital Projects and Planning Director Richard Best often says in the bigger picture of a project, Seattle Public Schools (SPS) meets the quota because it focuses on overall numbers, but not each group is meeting the quota. Locke said Best will discuss some of this in his upcoming presentation.

Locke said provisions can be added to mitigate problems.

DeWolf asked Hackney if provisions in other CWAs were helping WMBE concerns such as those he heard when he visited at a Tabor meeting. Hackney said more to be done. Locke said getting core workers tricky. Pavlik will have some data on this. Anderson explained the pool selection process and said using core workers helps grow businesses.

Locke discussed dual benefit reimbursement and said it is rare that firms ask for this. The dual reimbursement is a concern for contractors.

Locke reviewed owner responsibilities and said Pavlik will describe her program. LCP tracker software used to track information about payroll so a public agency can track who they are getting to see if we are achieving the goal to get more student works. Contractors used to not have incentive to use this system and didn’t understand it. Resources put in to help contractors because opting out of CWA is opting out of a lot of work.

Monitoring also done in owner responsibilities. Avoid paying improperly, which is an issue in vertical construction. Sometimes wages are stolen from workers. Wright asked clarifying questions. Anderson said sometimes people skirt around rules and hire workers of color but have them do lesser work.

Wright asked if ANEW monitors this. Dove said yes, they follow grads for two years, provide advice and work with students and contractors. Dove said apprentice program has standards that must be met. Wright asked where are opportunities? Dove said there is not data with unions but working with unions and contractors. These relationships are necessary because if you train students but don’t have relationships, where do they go, Dove said. Colbert clarified that it is not the apprentice program’s job to enforce rules on job sites, but monitoring is important.
Locke said tools get ahead of issues on a job site. Burke said accountability is difficult to implement. Each group has different levels or responsibilities. Where does common accountability and enforcement live? Locke responded that in the City of Seattle, the contractor division had procurement, construction contracts and enforcement group. Pavlik said apprentice programs help with accountability by serving on and advisory committee. Contractors have to come in monthly to talk about hiring, performance and how they are meeting rules on projects. This allows an opportunity to connect people who want to learn the trade.

Burke said a bulk of accountability is what the owner sets up. He wants to make sure this is authentic for all sides. Locke described communication process and ways this works. Adams said there is an acceptable worksite policy used by some to make sure this happens. It’s additional to CWA.

Locke provided a school example to illustrate the process of contractor responsibilities. Letter of assent starts the process. Union gives as much as they get in this process.

Business case from a city of Seattle perspective: Locke provided a chart that shows a shortage of workers, according to one study. Pavlik said it is 9 percent in public and private sector. DeWolf asked for clarification because we see a gap, but then we don’t have enough workers. Anderson said the problem is the ratio of journeyman to apprentices. He said they do a lot of organizing to bring on apprentices. Ratio is 1:1, some 2:1. DeWolf said this is limiting. Anderson said sometimes they do in-house testing and credit for time served to place folks where they need to be. Overall, the project requires a state-mandated ratio.

In 2020, Washington will become apprentice state. Pavlik said violate market and downturns are a concern. People don’t want to bring someone on for a several-year program and not meet the commitment. Report provided on MS Teams is regional public owner study by King County. It’s a workforce analysis from more than a year ago.

Locke said another argument for business case is more equitable, guaranteed work conditions and reduced unknowns, which affects bid price.

Disputes and walkouts do happen, Locke said. Public agencies have had them. Rainier Beach Community Center construction had picketed. The community noticed no black workers or people from the community working at the site. This was before CWA adopted. Locke gave examples of two current strikes in Seattle.

Locke reviewed the business concerns. PLA, CWA or SCWA can discourage open shops. Data is small, so it is not easy to say this reduces the bid pool. Same for costs. Locke said the Rainier Beach project allowed them to see process from both bid processes. They didn’t see an impact, and cost was actually less with the CWA.

DeWolf asked about complaints on process and tasks associated with CWA. Locke said there will always be complaints. Anderson gave an example of someone who complained but had worked on a project with a CWA. Said this happens a lot with public housing projects. Anderson reminded the task force we are focusing on students.
Minority and small businesses have a lot of concerns. We will hear from them, said Locke. Dove said some of this is lack of education, and she wants to build capacity. “You don’t create equity by lowering standards,” she said. Many of the complaints she hears are not factual.

Social equity case discussed. Groups such as the Urban League are involved in the process. Social equity is also about moving the needle on pay. Locke reviewed a chart of construction hours for different ethnic groups. She said the drop in number of Latinx might be due to the fact this group feels exposed by identifying themselves.

Hackney wants statistics on small contactors and businesses. Pavlik will dig into this in detail. Locke said there is not a significant change for minority and women-owned businesses before and after CWA. 16 percent vs 18 percent, Pavlik said. Locke said we are creating a pipeline for students and opening opportunities to high-wage jobs. DeWolf said the chart doesn’t show the whole picture and asked what is their debt load? Anderson mentioned Pavlik has a good chart to illustrate this.

Locke reviewed SPS data on students who enroll in college after high school. There is a gap between kids going into college. What alternative path do they choose, Locke asked. Pavlik said her experience is that a majority of that number would be women. Wright wonders what the completion rate is. Mounsey said that would be good data. Union apprentice rates of completion are higher than non-union. Seattle Promise could help with this. Wright will talk about this in January.

There are things task force could do impact student concerns. Hackney said there are things we can do to attract small businesses. Burke is excited for ways we can build in help for students. Some challenges: Principals. Present opportunities clearly to them. Take them on site. Wright said he has a long list of ideas to fight challenges and grow program within schools. Weir provided an example of a success story through the apprentice process. Hackney asked how the example student got in. ANEW helped them tip the scale. Weir said the waiting list is living list. Students meet set qualifications are invited and take an exam that ranks them. Then they go before panel and interview. Metrics are created from that, which is used to place students on the list.

Wright talked about promotion opportunities in the schools. Some kids don’t have access to gloves and boots. There are things we can do to help. Hackney asked if pre-apprentice programs provide equipment. Dove said some do, but a partner or funding source is needed to have money available for this. Wright visited Peninsula school program. He said their program is expensive but works. Pavlik said LA district has program.

Burke asked if our students are properly prepared for Dove’s programs. Dove said data available. Burke clarified that what should be driving our instruction – align with needs. Dove said that happens through relationships. Pavlik said that is something Mounsey is working on. Mounsey said they are working on construction core plus, which was originally brought to schools from Boeing. They are close to doing a pilot next school year but at a bigger Career and Technical Education (CTE) district.

Meeting adjourned at 11:55 a.m. with a reminder that the task force’s next meeting is Nov. 13 at the John Stanford Center. Locke said Anderson and union will have the first presentation. Then Richard Best will present regarding the BEXV levy. The presentation schedule will be juggled so people can hear from Pavlik.

mac